"Punk's Not Dead, It Lives on The Football Terraces": Tracing The Legacy of Punk in Subcultural Milieu of The Football Firms

Abstract

Hüseyin SERBES*

Contrary to the popular perception generated by the mainstream media, the notion of 'football firm' has a large subcultural milieu. When this subcultural universe is carefully investigated, an enduring legacy of punk attitude is detected. The center of the punk ethos, which provides a snapshot of the political and cultural landscape, is shaped by some aesthetic codes. This paper attempts to bring together the legacy of punk with the supporter subculture. The study, framed from the perspective of Marxist theory, aims to understand the symbols of resistance of youth subcultures with a micro-sociological perspective by focusing on fanzines within the scope of qualitative research design. With the critical discourse analysis carried out in this context, the modern football phenomenon, which destroys the subjectivity of the fans, is investigated. The findings reveal that Punk's aggressive, rhetorical and satirical aesthetic codes exist in the stands. The discovery of Punk, which offers a subcultural capital against commodification, alienation and commercialized football, may regenerate the praxis of pleasure, poetry, art, imagination, love and revolution on the football terraces.

*Sakarya Universty,
Institute for Social Sciences,
Department of
Communication Sciences,
PhD Candidate.
hserbes@yahoo.com
ORCID: 0000-0001-7913-6178.

Keywords: Punk, Subculture, Fans, Football Firms, Fanzine.

"Punk Ölmedi, Tribünlerde Yaşıyor": Tribün Gruplarının Altkültürel Ortamında Punk Mirasının İzlerini Sürmek

Özet

Hüseyin SERBES*

Anaakım medyanın oluşturmuş olduğu popüler algının tersine, tribün grubu kavramı, büyük bir altkültürel ortama sahiptir. Bu altkültürel evren, dikkatle soruşturulduğunda punk tavrının bitmek bilmeyen mirasına rastlanır. Politik ve kültürel manzaranın bir enstantanesini sunan punk değerlerinin merkezi bazı estetik kodlarla şekillenir. Bu çalışma, Punk'ın mirası ile taraftarlık altkültürünü bir araya getirmeyi deniyor. Marksist teorinin bakış açısıyla çerçevelenen çalışma, nitel araştırma deseni kapsamında, taraftar fanzinlerini odağa alarak mikro-sosyolojik bir perspektifle gençlik altkültürlerinin direniş sembollerini anlamayı amaçlıyor. Bu kapsamda gerçekleştirilen eleştirel söylem çözümlemesi ile taraftarların öznellik alanlarını yıkıma uğratan modern futbol olgusu soruşturuluyor. Bulgular, Punk'ın agresif, retorik ve hicivli estetik kodlarının tribünlerde var olduğunu ortaya koyuyor. Metalaşmaya, yabancılaşmaya ve ticarileşen futbola karşı bir altkültürel sermaye sunan Punk'ın keşfi, tribünlerde hazzın, şiirin, sanatın, hayal gücünün, aşkın ve devrimin praksisini yeniden yeşertebilir.

*Sakarya Üniversitesi
Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü,
İletişim Bilimleri ABD,
Doktora Öğrencisi.
hserbes@yahoo.com
ORCID: 0000-0001-7913-6178.

Anahtar Keliemeler: Punk, Altkültür, Taraftar, Futbol Grupları, Fanzin.

"Punk's Not Dead, It Lives on The Football Terraces":

1. Introduction

Perceptions in the mainstream media leave impressions that despise the individual in a football firm. The phenomenon of 'supporter', which is exhibited as only a small part of a recurring entertainment every weekend, constitutes a large subcultural environment consisting of many components. According to the perspectives pointed out, fans in a stadium are part of violence, brutality, or an inconsistent concept. However, it is not always possible to accept this as such. Ayres and Treadwell (2011, p. 95) inform that contrary to popular perception and media hype, those who take part in fan groups are not mindless bandits, but individuals who fulfill certain functions in their lives in a subcultural context.

This paper tries to bring together the legacy of punk and the subculture of football firms. Punk ethics, which has created an underground cultural form with the codes it has since the 1970s, has also deeply affected other subcultural environments. Therefore, by investigating these remains, this research aims to understand what fronts can be formed by supporters against today's commercialized and industrialized football. The basic idea of this study is based on the reaction of the working class, which was pushed out of the stadium in neo-liberal times. This study, which investigates football fandom with the Marxist theories proposed by Taylor (1971) and Clarke (1973), deals with the nature of punk and hooligan subcultures. As it is known, the capitalist understanding of football dissolves the concept of supporter and gives it other meanings. Youth subcultures, by their nature, want to remain in the game and not be alienated by exhibiting a kind of resistance. One of the areas where they can do this resistance is fanzines, which are seen as the legacy of punk. Fanzines, which reached their true value in the 1970s when punk emerged, are photocopy journals independent of any authority (Serbes & Guzel, 2020, p. 693). The research subjects of this study are football firms. Therefore, the current investigation resorts to discourses to understand the subcultural milieu of supporters. While the concepts of text and discourse show an increasing use in social sciences, it is possible to find these discourses in works with varying styles and registers (Wodak & Meyer, 2015). In this context, it is aimed to analyze the guiding discourses about the subculture of the fan formations by investigating the texts in the fanzines produced by Fenerbahçe supporters. 'Critical discourse analysis' was carried out on the relations in which the concepts were produced, on the historical processes and the paradigm.

The study tries to find answers to the following questions: How does modern football affect the field of the subjectivity of fans? What are the behaviors of the fan formations against the commercialized and industrialized football mentality? How can the relationship between punk and football firms be interpreted? What praxis can supporters realize against the perspectives of alienation and commodification? In what ways does the relationship between the revolutionary heritage of punk and the subcultural legacy of the football firms take place? The study aims to follow the traces of youth subcultures with an interdisciplinary effort in light of the summarized purpose and method. Thus, this article focuses on the meanings beyond the text from a micro-sociological perspective and reveals the symbols of resistance.

2. Literature and Conceptual Explanations

2.1 Subculture and Resistance: Perspectives

Research that seeks to understand subculture in the light of style, thought, and attitude has been nurtured by two traditions: the Chicago School and the Birmingham School, known as The Center for Contemporary Cultural Studies (CCCS).[1] Blackman (2014, p. 499) draws attention to the close relationship between biology and psychology in American and British subcultural theories in the definition of deviant behavior. British theory, in which the focus on subculture involves anomalies, is more apt to understand the subnormal in racial, social and economic contexts. In particular, the studies carried out in this manner in the late 1960s deepened the concept of subculture and brought it to the fore again. In this sense, youth movements such as subcultures and countercultures helped establish the perspective of resistance. As Blackman (2014) argues, CCCS subculture theory, though in an interpretative sociological framework derived from the Chicago School, epistemologically places emphasis on the consciousness of the agency. It is a harbinger of an important break with crime and deviance. This theory cares about the resistance of countercultures that are considered outside of popular culture. According to Cohen's critical theory of subculture (1972), it is those who are oppressed by the dominant culture, not the middle class, who produce the subculture. The CCCS theory, which finds its essence in the resistance and oppositional thought of oppressed cultures, has put the youth movements. This theoretical perspective was shaped by the ideas of intellectuals such as *Lévi-Strauss, Barthes, Althusser,* as Hall (1980) expressed, and embraced Gramsci's concept of hegemony. Basically, in this theoretical field, which deals with the performance of youth subcultures with resistance, ideas are found in the form of a 'collage'.

Subculture becomes a form of performance in thought, action, and narrative, not a sign of illness. Barnes (1979) points out that these performances have many application areas and states that youth become visible thanks to the practices created with the Do-it-yourself culture. Emphasizing the notion of punk, Hebdige (1979, p. 19) states that no subculture is more determined than punks to try to detach itself from the accepted area as in normalized forms. In Clark's words (2001, p. 234), even 'the death of punk'[2], one of these subcultures, left a new subcultural discourse and produced special spaces where culture could be produced with less capitalism, more autonomy and more anonymity.

2.2 Punk: The Style Created by Post-War Youth

The concept of 'punk', which was accepted in the terminology at the end of the 1970s, is not a mere form of music thanks to its political and aesthetic attitude. While describing punk, Benton (2018, p. 14) points out some common traits such as challenging the authority, resisting the mainstream, emphasizing the original

---

1 Corte (2012, p. 62) states that three approaches that emerged later were added to these two basic approaches to the origins of subcultural studies. These approaches are as follows: The Manchester School, the Post-Subculture and a Symbolic Interactionist Approach (see Corte, U. 2012. Subcultures and Small Groups: A Social Movement Theory Approach. Dissertation for the degree of Doctor of Philosopyh. Acta Universitatis Upsaliensis).

2 The notion of 'the death of punk', which Clark (2001, p. 234) sees as one of the great mysteries of the history of the subculture, contains great paradoxes: According to Clark, who draws attention to the subjectivity of punk other than the classical archetype, this discourse left a new subcultural legacy to his successors even as it died. It has made this legacy by producing a do-it-yourself culture, independent labels, specialty record stores and music venues (see: Clark, D. 2001. The Death and Life of Punk, the Last Subculture. 'No-Future: Punk 2001' conference, University of Wolverhampton, and Lighthouse, England).

and having a do-it-yourself aesthetic, although there is no monolithic and uniform subculture. Punk culture, which proceeds on an irregular path, has developed together with many factors such as opposing perspectives and all kinds of anti-nationalism. Errickson (2019, p. 7) asserts that there were also a number of other political, social and environmental factors that led to the development of punk culture. In particular, the collapse of stability with the period of 'recession' in England in the mid-1970s brought about a rising counter-movement among rockers. Henry (1989) who states that this punk scene is the true essence of the punk movement, sees it as a reaction against institutionalized art theories and techniques. The punk subculture, as a representation of an avant-garde attitude, draws attention as a mythical movement created by the post-war youth with its reactions to the sociopolitical climate of the period. After the First World War, a punk style frequently invoked the methods of the Dadaists and Surrealists, which provocatively confronted art with counter-art against traditional social norms.[3] These methods turned into "an aggressive act" with Hebdige's discourse (1998, p. 29). Thus, the developed consciousness made cultural and political activities a priority [in the punk scene].

> *"With so much happening in less than forty years, punk today has come to mean many different things; a family of music genres and subgenres, a philosophy, an attitude, fashion styles, and an entire subculture. However, punk music has always 'articulated' the subculture, and it is through punk music that punk culture is most often written about" (Dalbom, 2006, p. 39).*

As Dalbom (2006) argues, punk's past does not proceed in any linear nature, and furthermore, the culture (which punk creates) encompasses much more as a subculture than a musical genre, although it has evolved with music. Since 1976, the year of its debut, music, the dominant element of the subculture, seemed to take on and contribute to the hostility and mayhem that became part of the punk image, as Levine and Stumpf underlined (1983, p. 423). With its techniques, punk also includes the meta-narrative that heralds the deterritorialization of the individual in the society and the arrival of the post-industrial society. Especially in England in 1975, where the highest unemployment rates were observed, there was an increase in working-class and anti-capitalist movements, with the problems of young people not being able to finish school or not being able to find a job. Brake (1980) states that while young people try to cope with the contradiction created by the pressure on wealth, success and consumption, on the other hand, they begin to think that the social structure is managed by employers and politicians, whom they see as liars and abusers. When the darkness of the past and the future is taken into consideration, in such a sociopolitical atmosphere, the songs of punk rock bands turn into anthems in the tongues of the desperation youth.

2.3 Resilient Communities of Liquid Modernity: Avant-garde Youth and Football Hooliganism

The world we call modern gradually pushes the individual into loneliness. This loneliness, in a sense, is a phenomenon that can be overcome with the cooperation

---

3 As David Laing stated in One Chord Miracles, one of the most distinctive features of 'punk rock' is that it first awakened and then disturbed the organization of opportunity, which holds the authority of power and control, with its unique phenomenon [Laing, D. (2002). One Chord Wonders: Power and Meaning in Punk Rock].

of people who have come together for certain purposes. Bozkurt (2011) points out the impossibility of a world without groups and organizations by questioning how we can live if the society we live in consists of single individuals with no cooperation among themselves. Ideas of expanding this union with football go back in time. In particular, the broader social functions beyond participation in football have a long history dating back to the nineteenth century. (Sanders et al., 2012, p. 5). However, it is not possible to talk about belonging to a group when talking about all individuals coming together in a football stadium. With these individuals embracing each other for a purpose, the existence of the group can only be mentioned. In the 'liquid modernity' that Bauman (2000) puts forward, the concepts of time and space do not separate from each other, paving the way for the community. When football shrines are not seen as temples of consumption[4], they represent a real example of community. Thus, the individuals in these places are separated from the hordes that are met by chance and carry the characteristics of the community. In this context, the representation of being together in the times we live in can be seen among football fans. The placement of such formations in football turns sports competitions into cultural venues. Alver (2008) sees football, which is an element that unites people from different languages, cultures or social backgrounds, as a social field where group belongings are defined and identity is acquired, behavioral principles are shaped. In particular, stadiums function as a social movement task area with a high level of organization.

The motivations of individuals to take part in a 'firm' differ. Likewise, the requirements of being in a supporter group and therefore being included in the group differ among the participants. The results of research conducted by Peat (2016, pp. 42-43) showed that for some, active participation is a way of performing or demonstrating the ability to fulfill a role within a firm, while for others it is not seen as a hierarchical role, so it is perceived as a natural sequence of events rather than an ability to fulfill a role. Despite the fact that the concept of hooligan is associated with violent incidents, the role that fans in groups play in increasing the value of football as a result of their active actions is undeniable. The firm actors believe in the continuation of the existence of this culture as the bearers against the reification of football by becoming a commodity (Serbes & Eskicumali, 2021, p. 154). In this sense, it can be clearly seen that most of the previous studies made generalizations with the results obtained from an 'outside eye'. Therefore, it is objectionable to call fan events that enhance football culture collectively as hooliganism. Redhead's (1993, p. 3) comment that a well-agreed "definition of football hooliganism" has never been established, and this gives us the opportunity to think again about hooliganism. The field research conducted by Rookwood and Pearson (2012), which consists of a series of ethnographic studies, also revealed the positive aspects of fan formations that are marginalized as 'hooligans' in terms of fan relations against those who see only their harmful aspects in a practical context. Therefore, the place of supporter groups associated only with violence in contemporary community theories can be reconsidered. In this context, football, which has become industrialized and commodified and therefore has lost its natural

---

4 According to Bauman (2000), places that George Ritzer called "temples of consumption" consist of individuals who came together by chance rather than community. Since Bauman draws attention to the fact that there is no collective aspect to this situation, this study takes into account the fan formations that come together consciously in football stadiums.

game image, resembles a systematic market that opens a window to the world of the show rather than the active action of the fan groups.

Debord (1967) expresses the alienation of the audience from the object watched in the society of the spectacle as "the more the audience watches, the less they experience". The existence of fan groups within the football industry, which includes such a world of the show, tries to prevent the alienation feeling of the individual as much as possible. The collective organization emanating from here makes a contribution to the subculture of football firms in all countries. In this sense, Spaaij (2007, p. 412) characterizes the notion of football hooliganism as a transnational phenomenon, noting that this phenomenon has no legal definition and no clear-cut boundaries, but is used to encompass various actions that take place more or less directly in football-related contexts. According to Pearson (1983, p. 40), the term *'hooligan'* came into English usage in the late nineteenth century to describe "gangs of vulgar youths", a corruption of 'Houlihan', the name of an Irish family then living in London known for their love of fighting. Although the hooligan label is associated with violence, it has different meanings in the context of nations and locales. For example, ultra-groups in Italy have a highly formal organizational nature and thus their primary function is to provide meaningful support to the football teams they support (De Biasi, 1998). In addition to the mainstream supporter groups in Turkey, fan formations adopting the *'Punk ethos'* emerged, and they carried out some activities as militant fan groups without establishing a hierarchical organization.

3. Methodology

This study was carried out using the qualitative research method accompanied by a paradigm that presents the intersections of punk culture codes, aesthetics and ideas around football firms. The qualitative paradigm, which offers an opportunity for interpretive, literary and critical thinking, guided this research in the analysis of ideas. Frankel and Devers (2000, p. 253) suggest that qualitative methods will be needed when questions create puzzles that are difficult to address using traditional research approaches. Since this article carries a phenomenological perspective beyond numbers and statistics, qualitative research is needed to understand and interpret the experiences of youth subcultures.

3.1 Research Field of the Study

Mason (2002, p. 2) points out that qualitative research is an exciting activity, and states that through qualitative research we can explore a wide variety of dimensions of the social world, including experiences, dreams, and relationships of participants in our field of research. In this sense, the study tries to understand the social world of youth movements in the subcultural environment. The universe of the current research, which seeks the way to this world in texts, is fanzines of the football firms. Worley (2015, pp. 36-37) explains that from a historical perspective, fanzines provide a snapshot of the socio-economic, cultural and political change of the period they are in. Many of the fanzines that offer such a field of study in revealing the changing parameters are undated and innumerable. Furthermore, Henry (1989) argues that because fanzines contain anonymous texts, it is nearly impossible to identify the authors and editors, and

to obtain information on their budgets, distribution locations, and how long they have been out. For this reason, this study was limited to a specific sample due to the limited availability of fanzines to all studies. This limitation was determined using purposive sampling strategies. According to Robinson (2014, p. 7), purposive sampling strategies in which certain case categories in a sampling universe are represented in non-random ways enable the researcher to find perspectives on the subject under investigation. Accordingly, the research area consists of fanzines created by the leading fan groups of Fenerbahçe football team. These fanzines are *1907 Genclik Fanzine, Cefakâr Maraton, Fenerbahceli Cemil, Keyif Tekel, Papazin Cayiri, Ver Lefter'e.* These journals, prepared in A5 size, stapled and photocopied, were distributed irregularly and aperiodically. The main reasons for the designation of these fanzines as a field of study can be listed as follows: (i) the convenience of the researcher in accessing publications, and (ii) the fact that the group of fans sampled represents an avant-garde youth movement in Turkey with its large, colorful and diverse organizations.

The semantic and syntactic structure of the texts selected from the fanzines specified as samples in the study were interpreted within the scope of critical discourse studies. Although more traditionally called critical discourse analysis, it is possible to find some principles of critical discourse studies in the critical theory of the Frankfurt School before the Second World War (Agger, 1992). According to Van Dijk (2015a), critical discourse analysis is discourse analytic research that examines the power centers and forms of resistance against them legitimated by text and speech in the social and political context. Utilizing multiple disciplines, this work provides a critical perspective with an attitude that resists domination. Taking a critical approach to discourse based on such an ethical understanding, this study, in Van Dijk's words (2015b, p. 466), "takes an open position against the dominant, understands social inequality and ultimately seeks to challenge it".

3.2 Data Analysis

A qualitative study interprets the perspectives of the studied subject in sociocultural and linguistic contexts, and most importantly, it is sensitive to data by carefully considering the meanings while performing them (Yardley, 2017, p. 295). In this research process, the data obtained were approached sensitively and interpreted. In qualitative research methods, collecting information in the natural environment, being close to the research area, and obtaining additional information come to the fore in the validity and reliability of the study. In this way, the study verified these parameters by collecting data in a rigorous and comprehensive manner.

Thematic analysis was adopted in order to reveal the patterns of meaning around a qualitative data set and to make sense of the data. Ontological and epistemological analytical analyzes were conducted in the light of research questions in this approach, which is preferred in order to be able to define and interpret the patterns in the dataset consisting of discourses in fanzines. Braun, Clarke and Weate (2016) draw attention to the stages of "familiarization, coding, theme development, refinement, naming and writing up" in the data analysis process and argue that these stages will increase the scientific value of the research while analyzing. In line with this information, the data analysis process was carried out with the parameters determined in the research,

respectively. The themes determined through the codes were built and these themes were discussed and interpreted within the theoretical framework.

Table 1. Code and Theme Sampling on the Data Analysis Process

Code	Theme	Extract
Alienation	Deployment of Fans Outside the Stadium: The Nomadic Movement As Post-Fan Behavior	"We continue to meet with our friends before the match as much as possible and experience the stadium ambiance on the streets".
Fanzine	Underground Media of the Hardcore Fans: Fanzines	"Those were the years when I fed my protest and anarchist spirit with music. Then I questioned why these fanzines did not include Fenerbahce and football".
Do-it-yourself	Identity, Authenticity and Aesthetic: Subcultural Capital on Football Terraces	"With the away trips made abroad and the development of internet forums, the banners made by the fans in the form of do-it-yourself, started to be seen in our stands".

3.3 An Epistemic Break to the Football Industry: Theoretical Frame of the Present Study

Orthodox sociological studies on supporter groups as a counter-cultural experience that can be evaluated within 'Cultural Studies' generally tend to consider this subculture in the context of violence. In contrast, recent literature studies have revealed that events that industrialize football, such as modern football and the commercialization of the game, are effective in the emergence of these militant fan formations. Spaaij (2007, p. 415) asserts that:

Hardcore supporters can be explained by three theoretical approaches that are quite clearly defined in studies across various disciplines of the social sciences: (i) Marxist approaches put forward by Ian Taylor and John Clarke; (ii) the figurational approach offered by the 'Leicester School'; and (iii) the postmodernist approaches of Giulianotti and Redhead.

The Marxist approach, which deals with the football fan subculture in the context of economic and social changes, naturally places the working class in the position of the subject. It has the idea that football is breaking away from tradition and alienating working-class supporters. The figurational approach highlights the lower layers of society. Researchers within this perspective argue that "between 70 percent and 80 percent of football hooligans are the working class with low formal education, and are most commonly employed in manual occupations" (Bairner, 2006, p. 587). In addition, Spaaij (2007) informs that the 'Leicester School', with their well-known research on the nature of football hooliganism, did not see this phenomenon as new, so they adopted an eclectic approach that resulted in a synthesis of historical, sociological and psychological approaches. The Postmodernist approach, proposed by Giulianotti and Redhead, focuses on subcultures and fandom, and presents sections about the cultural lives of certain fan groups. This perspective is also based on the idea that "there were significant changes in the masculine football culture towards the end of the 1980s into the 1990s" (Spaaij, 2007, p. 417). This theory argues that as a result of these changes, football culture is destroyed by the popular fan and media cooperation. According to Giulianotti (1999), the combination of the new generation fan culture and wild media

indicates an epistemic break in football.

The present study attempts to understand the nature of punk and hooligan subcultures in football culture. From this point of view, the Marxist perspective is the source of the soul of this study. The basic idea of the current study is based on the fact that the changes experienced in football in recent years have pushed the working-class supporters out of the game. This removal threatens this subculture, reaching its peak with industrialization and commercialization, especially in neo-liberal times. Supporters belonging to the working class feel alienated from the game with the changes in the labor market. In addition, professionalization and internationalization further separate football from its working-class roots. Taylor's thought (1971, p. 369) was that the movement of football hooliganism should be interpreted as resistance. This idea is a revolutionary reaction against the bourgeoisification of football by preserving the nature of this game, which we can describe as a subculture. Similarly, according to Clarke (1973), the idea of hooliganism, which is seen as a post-war youth subculture, is a symbolic attempt to break football from its tradition by transforming it into a form of spectacle. In this context, Marxist theory, which considers fan actions as a form of traditional football protection, constitutes the theoretical framework of this study.

4. Findings and Discussion

4.1 Deployment of Fans Outside the Stadium: The Nomadic Movement As Post-Fan Behavior

The fans located in football stadiums, individually and collectively, produce various discourses about the clubs they belong to. Some of these discourses, which take place in the rhythm of daily life and contemporary, are exhibited in every single field of the stadiums. Stadiums are a kind of fairground for the fans. The banners in almost every stadium reflect the adventure of modern football in a sense.

> *"I had the experience of being (the subject) in a firm at a time when the political environment (relatively) was not that hot in Turkey and industrial football was not felt that much. I gained cultural knowledge in contradictions, differences and conflicts. I had experienced sharing joy and sorrow in a collective way. On the other hand, aside from all these experiences, I no longer take part in stadiums because football has surrounded our subjectivity as a result of commercial concerns" (Erden Kosova, in Ver Lefter'e, Issue 2).*

Football, which can be shown as one of the absolute dominant areas of modernity, affects the subjectivity areas of the fans. In this direction, it can be observed that the fans, who put a new face on 'football game' in the stadiums with their actions and performative presence, are no longer in their routine places. The bourgeoisification of football is taking the game in another direction. In line with this, Kennedy and Kennedy (2016, p. 18) argue that elite football seeks to achieve the consumer desires of millions of fans watching or attending matches at home or in public spaces. At a time when football fans turn into customers, the elite football phenomenon is intensely deforming the supporter subculture. In particular, this notion tends to reach and influence the fans as consumers. Global media and transnational sponsorships are

transforming the game by dominating fans.

> *"I miss the more intimate and more laborious times of non-industrialized football. After the night matches and the season ticket application, limited seats were reserved for the rival fans for derby matches. With this situation, the classification of supporters has changed. If we go back to the eighties and nineties, we used to wait until noon game time the night before. Gone are the days of brutal fights with opposing fans, but also spending time in the stands until the start of the match. We came to the times when capitalism showed its effect. In this period called industrial football, the fans cannot spend time in the stands before the match. Because of this, production, sharing and ownership among fans decreased"* (Volkan Eruçar, in Cefakâr Maraton, Issue 3).

> *"At a time when communication technologies were not so intense, fan subculture was naturally stronger. In the 90s, fan groups competed in real and physical terms, not virtually. Therefore, the labors of the fans were sacred. The takeover of football by sponsors and companies, and the dominance of new media technologies took football in another direction"* (Ferhat Eren, in 1907 Genclik, Issue 2).

> *"I think we have become strangers to the game itself. The increase in ticket prices and the domination of football by the ruling classes have changed the dimension of fandom as well as football itself. The culture of supporter continues to disappear"* (Ugur Tuzcular, in Fenerbahceli Cemil, Issue 1).

The commodification and commercialization of football and, accordingly, the alienation of all actors from the game, from players to fans, become clearer from the perspective of Marxist theory. Marx (1975) expresses the commodification of labor with his theory that the worker is alienated from the products he/she produces, the act of producing, his/her real nature and from other workers, and this commodification seems very obvious and insignificant at first glance, its analysis is full of metaphysical subtleties. According to James (2018, p. 8), Marxist approaches (though now unfashionable throughout academia) work best when analyzing the rise of alienation associated with the football industry's transition to a higher stage of capitalism and the ideological repositioning of the fan as a 'consumer'. The perspectives of alienation and commodification show that football clubs are under the influence of capitalism. These theories broaden our way of thinking about fan consciousness. James, Murdoch and Guo (2018) argue that the community atmosphere in stadiums with seats will not be what it used to be, reminding that high-priced tickets and season ticketing practices can be effectively sold to middle-class consumers. This is related to who will sit next to you on the tickets sold. Thus, predetermined situations prevent fans from wanting to stand next to each other. It leads to the alienation of the fans from each other and the decrease of their feelings towards the clubs.

> *"It was not enjoyable to be in the stands as it used to be. There was a situation that led to the abolishing of season tickets after every speech in the stadium, surrounded by cameras, and after every speech criticizing the board of directors. We were expected not to criticize in the chants and banners we displayed. This*

was obviously fascism. At a time when it was not possible for me to personally withstand these heavy sanctions of the surveillance power, I decided to leave the stands" (Utku Sayan, in Papazin Cayiri, Issue 1).

"Fenerbahçe is my biggest passion. It is impossible for me to give up, but I did not enter the stadium again, especially after the Passolig practice. Instead, we meet with friends around the stadium before the match, eat, drink and cheer. It is not easy to get rid of old habits, but I realized that I find the atmosphere that gives me the greatest pleasure" (Ilker Ercan, in Fenerbahceli Cemil, Issue 5).

"While football teams compete on the field, fan groups try to establish dominance in the stands. That's what being a hardcore fan is like. The fact that football components of the industry unseated the supporter groups from their places, in a way deterritorialized them, carried the competition to social media. We continue to meet with our friends before the match as much as possible and experience the stadium ambiance on the streets" (Anil Ozturk, in Keyif Tekel, Issue 1).

Pilz and Wölki-Schumacher (2010, p. 8) talk about the 'Ultra' fans who stand out with their attitude towards life beyond the fan culture, with the increasing professionalization of the sport. An important point in the 'Ultra identity' is that this youth culture has an attitude that they carry throughout their lives. They come together and develop a new awareness of life. Although they were in a very visible structure in the stadium before, the distance between the game and the fans drove them away from the stands. The analysis within the texts (in fanzines) above confirms that hardcore fans, referred to as Ultra among Fenerbahçe fans, often come together. It is understood that this place of unity is not always stadiums. This situation is not unique to supporters in Turkey. Armstrong (1998), who conducted an empirical study among the members of Sheffield United's Blades hooligan firm, explains that the fans gathered in pubs to watch the matches against the increasing ticket prices. Fans watching a match near the Bramall Lane Stadium is described as 'post-fan' behavior, in Armstrong's words (James, Murdoch & Guo, 2018, p. 4). It is seen that a large number of Fenerbahce fan groups, displaying post-fan behavior, come together in cafés, restaurants or pubs near Sukru Saracoglu Stadium, bringing almost the atmosphere of the stadium to these venues. Thus, the fans, who have experienced an epistemic break against the industrialization of the game, have displayed a movement against alienation in football by continuing such unity.

4.2 Underground Media of the Hardcore Fans: Fanzines

Although the emergence of the term 'fanzine' spans a wide period going back to 1949 to describe magazines produced by and for science fiction fans, it finds its true meaning in a cultural iconoclastic manifestation in the UK and USA of the 1970s (Shaw, 1989; Jary, Horne & Bucke, 1991). Fanzines that emerged during this period, such as Sniffin' Glue and Ripped and Torn, were journals that were produced on a small scale as possible and used punk's do-it-yourself philosophy as an inspiring propaganda item (Hebdige, 1979, pp. 111-112).

"The journals I once acquired in Kadikoy and Taksim (which I later learned were called fanzines) caught my attention. Those were the years when I fed

153

> my protest and anarchist spirit with music. Then I questioned why these fanzines did not include Fenerbahce and football. I asked my friends who did not miss the away games in the stands to write an article. My friends who *made handmade banners in Yogurtcu Park (next to the stadium) wrote the story of them. We interviewed former cheerleaders on the changing fan culture. This is how this fanzine was born" (Alpaslan Ozcelik, in Cefakâr Maraton, Issue 1).*

> *"Fenerbahceli Cemil was actually born as a spin-off in a few issues of Dahke Fanzine. It was a fanzine containing the thoughts of punks in Turkey and around the world on football. It was only distributed underground. The fanzine was completely anti-modern football. Its name also contains a nostalgic atmosphere. A nice unity was born around the fanzine, who knows, maybe it will be revived one day in accordance with the attitude of fanzine and punk culture. After all, we are still against modern football" (Tahir Akyel, in Fenerbahceli Cemil, Issue 1)*

According to Dixon (2020, p. 102), the first of the fanzines created by football fans in Britain in the 1970s and 1980s to share their thoughts and fears about the game was the 'Foul' fanzine launched in 1972 by Cambridge University students. With the production of the fanzine 'When Saturday Comes' in 1986, the number of fanzines increased to one thousand in 1992 (Harte, p. 1993). As Brewster recalls (1993, p. 14), the first generation of football fanzines was heavily influenced by punk culture. Mondo Trasho, a work that emerged from the publication of personal writings and images through photocopying in Turkey in 1991 and can be seen as a field of cultural production, opened a pioneering field of art by bringing concepts and things together (Serbes, 2021, p. 237). From this point on, there has been an increase in the number of fanzines published in many fields. Fanzines, which have been enriched with the cut-and-paste style of punk since the time they emerged from Mondo Trasho, have acquired an avant-garde position by using the possibilities of their era. When the football fanzines that disseminated in Turkey are examined, it is seen how important the door opened by Mondo Trasho is. In particular, it is observed that the fanzines used in the research sample are influenced by the attitude of punk culture.[5]

> *"This fanzine does not contain racist or sexist views. In this fanzine, critical statements are made to strengthen the Fenerbahçe stand. I would like to remind you that your opinions and ideas are very important for an independent supporter structure. It was seen in the derby match we played last week, how important even the efforts of a few people are for the course of the game. Therefore, your participation in the choreographic preparations will strengthen our team. We need to choose the chants that will contribute to the team. Therefore, we must continue to produce" (Ali Ata, Ver Lefter'e, Issue 2).*

The discourses here reveal the cultural existence of the fanzines in the area where they are distributed. Fanzines are made by fans for fans. Although audio-visual tools come to the fore today, it is seen that they were active in their own fields in the period when text-based journals emerged. As the production area of hardcore fans, fanzines have been the production area of critical thinking. Fanzines, which make meticulous

Medya ve Kültür Dergisi

---

5 If we consider that the name When Saturday Comes is taken from the title of a song by the Irish punk band The Undertones, we can understand how the punk attitude had an effect on the first football fanzines..

efforts to avoid racist and sexist views, are also representative of protest tendencies.

> *"You can find our fanzine in a few bookstores in Kadıköy and in our friends around the stadium. We were able to make limited copies in this number. But we think that the interviews, articles and criticisms. We think that the fire lit from here will lead to new ideas, as in many choreographies" (Cenk Gunel, 1907 Genclik, Issue 4).*

Although they have impressive power in the period they are in, this influence is within a limited area. Fanzines, as is known, are magazines whose distribution takes place within a small area. Fanzine producers create magazines with an amateur spirit. Zinesters, who do not earn any income from here, work with 'a labour of love', in Duke's (1991) words (as cited in Millward, 2008, p. 301). This endeavour of love contains many features of punk culture. For example, Duncombe (1997) argues that these publications, which he sees as a collective work of fanzine producers, carry a new form of communication. In this sense, the fandom subculture creates a co-creation process and a novel form of communication in these pages. The power of communication achieved, in a way, reflects the greatest power that fanzines have at the time they are in circulation. This power in fanzines is, according to Atton (2010), one of the cheapest ways to express ideas and engage in discussion in a collective way. So to build a fanzine is to form a contact form within ideas and discussions. Combined with the protest and anarchist style of football fandom culture, the sample fanzines in the present study not only helped to construct a new language of communication, but also allowed ideas to circulate among the fans.

> *"I find the escape from the dominant and authoritative football in the text, which I see as a shelter. Fanzines should be the only place where this article can take place. Writing anonymously is like lighting a torch while wearing a mask in the stands. To write these lines as an unrecognizable person means to be in the stadiums without an identity. Being able to write like this and be on the pages of a fanzine seems like the biggest condition for being political and protest for me. In order to criticize all kinds of power, surveillance cults, commoditized games and industrial football, it is necessary to be a truly independent fanzine. What is written here is ultimately the co-production of not only the author but also the crowd. This fanzine belongs to Fenerbahçe fans" (Ozan Akkaya, Papazin Cayiri, Issue 2).*

Fanzines, which have a significant impact on the subculture of fans, in a sense, constitute examples of minor literature in Fenerbahçe stands. Deleuze and Guattari (1986, p. 13) describe the revolutionary conditions of minor literature as "the deterritorialization of language, political immediacy, and collective value". Many of the texts in the fanzines are deterritorialized in an anonymous, undated, and ungrammatical way. An unidentified zinester disappears in rows cheering on the stadium. In a sense, this ignites the political and oppositional spirit; that is, it politicizes the fanzine. The fanzine is against everything, especially the dominant. And now what is written in the fanzine is not the author's but the multitude. The fanzine has a collective value now. Thus,

the concept of organizational rhizomatics can be applied to subvert and interrupt the dominant unity around thought and idea, and to deviate from a consolidating schema of existence (Kornberger, Rhodes & Bos, 2006, p. 71). Since fanzines are the opposite of all ideas and hierarchies that are institutionalized in a holistic way, they acquire a rhizomatic appearance by carrying all the features of minor literature. Therefore, fanzines represent an ironic attitude of punk subculture as anonymous journals composed of heterogeneous elements.

4.3 Identity, Authenticity and Aesthetic: Subcultural Capital on Football Terraces

Subcultural capital, conceptualized by Thortnton (1995, p. 27), affects young people's stance, in a sense gives them status, and is embodied by objectifying as knowing the latest styles. Fan organizations in football terraces develop with subcultural productions such as current cheers, banners, posters and fanzines. Moreover, these productions are performed just like the products exhibited in the areas where cultural capital is distributed. For example, supporting the co-chanting of contemporary slang is a manifestation of subcultural capital. The banner in the stands on a weekend can be perceived as a discourse production area of the fan group.

> *"Although hand-made banners were rarely seen in the past, in the years when the banner culture was dominant, banners made of canvas were more common. In particular, the banners among the groups in Europe, where the Ultras subculture and opposition supporters were present, attracted our attention. With the away trips made abroad and the development of internet forums, the banners made by the fans in the form of do-it-yourself, started to be seen in our stands" (Baris Sayan, Keyif Tekel, Issue 3).*

> *"The visual feast, which was carried to another dimension with the 'Since 1453' banner that we opened in the stands during the match we played with Panathinaikos, turned into a classic with the long-lasting preparations of the groups affiliated with our supporters' union. The graphic style used in the banners looks decidedly avant-garde and provocative" (Murat Yanmaz, Papazin Cayiri, Issue 1).*

> *"The Pink Mafia banner at the Sevilla match, where we were detained by the police saying 'Are you a new mafia formation?', is in an unforgettable position in terms of being tragicomic. The preparation of banners with satirical and ironic purposes is quite tiring, but even a snapshot in the stands is worth it. Other than that, I would like to keep the '100 Years of Legend from Generation to Generation' banner separate. A week's labor was given to the 70-meter banner. It was made in a 10-meter section of a car park in Istanbul. We struggled for hours with hairdryers to paint and dry the 5-meter section of the banner. The fact that the season was winter made our work very difficult. After all that hard work, a magnificent banner appeared" (Mert Kacan, Cefakâr Maraton, Issue 5).*

The banner activity seen in the stands seems to have weakened due to the efforts of industrial football to get advertisements. However, it is inevitable that the visual feast that emerged when the fan scene in the years when hardcore fans were active is similar to some ideologies in punk culture. The youth movement in Britain adopts an openly

nihilistic attitude towards the industry itself, with an outspoken ideology that 'anyone can do it' (Bestley, 2007, p. 37). The do-it-yourself ethic that anyone can do anything is a real force in punk. Parkes (2014, p. 51) draws attention to the necessity of DIY ethics, which he sees as the heart of the subculture, while producing, recording, writing and performing music. Just as this power can be thought of as a weapon against the music industry, the banner making process, which fans spend days in, has the meaning of being a voice against commercialized football. Pilkington (2012, p. 263) states that when visual representations and performances of punk are analyzed together with their subjective fields, not singularly, it can be easier to reveal its historical dynamic. In this sense, the banner works in Fenerbahçe firms, to which the supporters contribute through collaboration, are reflected as a manifestation of punk aesthetics. Moreover, fan groups reflect an authentic environment as a result of such work. In addition to the punk ideology, the graphic language used in the banners visually reflects a style of punk. As Bestley emphasizes (2020, p. 1), punk, which has an aggressive and rhetorical visual style, cannot be tied to a single approach to graphic design like its accompanying music. The punk attitude, whose ideological thinking is that anyone can do it, parallels the iconic works put forward in the fandom subculture. The style of punk, which carries out the questioning of all kinds of authority in an oppositional and independent way, strengthens the fan groups that adopt this view. Incorporating an eclectic array of activities, the visual language of punk, as Hebdige theorized (1979), adopts the bricolage approach, which combines many different things as a radical act of strategy. In addition to this view, Bestley (2020) states that although these visual and aesthetic codes carry a language that declares individuality and autonomy, they are related to group solidarity. Considering the importance of group solidarity in the awareness of supporters, it is seen that stadiums are cultural distribution areas of punk's aesthetic codes.

5. Summary and Concluding Comments

The fact that fans refer to the concept of the game when talking about commercialized football is a sign of a huge industry that has become elite and bourgeois. The understanding of seeing the fans as consumers and glorifying the sponsors destroys the areas of subjectivity. When the fanzines in this study are examined with discursive analysis, it is observed that the fan formations that turn football into a riot of colors, with their actions and performative existence, have begun to leave their usual place. The deals made by transnational corporations with football clubs are aimed at destroying loyal fans. This understanding is quite insistent on seeing everyone as a customer by transforming the game. In the words of Kennedy and Kennedy (2016, p. 18), "every individual involved in a football-related action in the private or public sphere is a consumer desired to be achieved by the stakeholders of elite football". The conversion from fan to consumer is the ultimate desire of a commodification process. Marx (1975) demonstrated that although alienation and commodification may seem trivial at first, their analysis is full of metaphysical subtleties. From this point of view, this study investigated the components of the punk attitude and opened up a discussion on the position of these codes against the capitalist football understanding. The perspectives of alienation and commodification reveal the evolution idea of the fans who turn the stadium into a fairground. This perspective depicts the fan's return

to the spectator and then the customer. Accordingly, James, Murdoch and Guo (2018) argue that the community atmosphere in stadiums filled with middle-class consumers will never be the same as before. The opinion of the hardcore fans in the fanzines included in the sample supports this finding. High-priced tickets and season ticketing practices have gradually transformed the supporter subculture in Turkey. The zinesters emphasized that these practices disrupted the days when they were once together. Getting away from one another has removed the collective feeling from football stadiums. In Armstrong's words (1998), the displacement situation that occurs by gathering near the stadium, which is described as 'post-fan behavior', has also been frequently seen among Fenerbahçe fans. Current economic developments reveal that post-fan behavior continues to increase and fan formations will have to move away from their magnificent period.

In an environment where such a subculture is on the verge of extinction, this study revealed that fans can benefit greatly from Punk culture. Brewster (1993) draws attention to the early examples of football fanzines and argues that these fanzines were heavily influenced by punk culture. First-generation football fanzines in Britain, such as Foul and When Saturday Comes, arose from the underground nature of punk. Considering that the fanzines reflecting the fan subculture in Turkey are inspired by Mondo Trasho, the first example in the country, a consistency between punk and football can be seen (Serbes & Eskicumali, 2021, p. 153). In our world where social media channels dominate the discourse, a limitation has been observed in considering fanzines as a cultural production area. Yet, as Duke (1991) puts it, fanzine producers struggle for 'a labour of love'. As Duncombe (1997) argues, fanzines within a collective production site adopt a novel form of communication. In this respect, supporter fanzines, by their very nature, have a cultural fabric that is collective and open to communication. Fanzines with minor literature and rhizome analogies conceptualized by Deleuze and Guattari (1986) are publications with political and collective value, in which language is deterritorialized. A fanzine producer politicizes the fanzine by writing anonymously.

Fans can resist the dynamics of modern football with subcultural productions such as cheers, banners, posters and fanzines. In performing them, they draw on subcultural capital, as Thortonton (1995, p. 27) puts it. This power is influenced by the nihilistic attitude of punk. Aggressive, rhetorical and satirical language extends from the punk scene to the stadiums. The discovery of punk in the stands may prevent the reification of this subculture and enable us to relive the praxis of pleasure, poetry, art, imagination, love and revolution.

Medya ve Kültür Dergisi

REFERENCES

Agger, B. (1992). *The Discourse of Domination: From the Frankfurt School to Postmodernism.* Evanston: Northwestern University Press.

Alver, F. (2008). Kapitalist üretim sürecinde ırkçılık, futbol ve medya. İletişim Kuram ve Araştırma Dergisi, Kış-Bahar, 26, pp. 223–248.

Armstrong, G. (1998). *Football Hooligans: Knowing the Score.* Oxford/New York: Berg.

Atton, C. (2010). Popular music fanzines: Genre, aesthetics, and the 'democratic donversation'. *Popular Music and Society,* 33(4), pp. 517–531.

Ayres, T. C., & Treadwell, J. (2011). Bars, drugs and football thugs: Alcohol, cocaine use and violence in the night time economy among English football firms. *Criminology & Criminal Justice.* 12(1), pp. 83–100.

Barnes, R. (1979). *Mods!* London: Plexus.

Bauman, Z. (2000). *Liquid Modernity.* Cambridge: Polity Press.

Benton, A. (2018). *Punks in the church: The relationship between the punk subculture and church in East Germany.* (Master's Thesis, Western Michigan University, Michigan, USA). Retrieved from https://scholarworks.wmich.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=4398&context=masters_theses

Bestley, R. (2007). *Hitsville UK: Punk rock and graphic design in the faraway towns, 1976-84.* (Doctoral dissertation, University of the Arts, London). Retrieved from https://ualresearchonline.arts.ac.uk/id/eprint/2296/8/PhDFinalThesisDS.pdf

Bestley, R. (2020). Punk Rock!! So What? – Negotiating an Exhibition of Punk Art and Design. In Grimes, M. & Dines, M. (Eds.), *Punk Now!! Contemporary Perspectives on Punk* (pp. 204-219). Intellect Books Ltd, Bristol, UK and Chicago, US.

Blackman, S. J. (2014). Subculture theory: An historical and contemporary assessment of the concept for understanding deviance. *Deviant Behavior*, 35 (6),496-512.

Bozkurt, V. (2011). *Değişen Dünyada Sosyoloji: Temeller, Kavramlar, Kurumlar.* Bursa: Ekin.

Brake, M. (1980). *The Sociology of Youth Culture and Youth Subcultures: Sex and Drugs and Rock 'n' Roll?* London: Routledge.

Braun, V., Clarke, V. & Weate, P. (2016). Using Thematic Analysis in Sport and Exercise Research. In B. Smith, & A. C. Sparkes (Eds.), *Routledge Handbook of Qualitative Research In Sport and Exercise.* (pp. 191-205). London: Taylor & Francis (Routledge).

Brewster, B. (1993). When saturday comes and other football fanzines. *The Sports Historian*, 13(1), pp. 14-21.

Clarke, J. (1973). *Football Hooliganism and the Skinheads*. Birmingham: Centre for Contemporary Cultural Studies.

Dalbom, C. J. (2006). *Underground in the confederate capital: Punk subculture in richmond, Virginia.* (Master's Thesis, Louisiana State University. Los Angeles, USA). Retrieved from https://digitalcommons.lsu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=3954&context=gradschool_theses

De Biasi, R. (1998). The policing of hooliganism in Italy. In Porta, D., D. & Reiter, H. (Eds.). *Policing Protest. The Control of Mass Demonstrations in Western Democracies* (pp. 213-227). Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Debord, G. (1967). *The Society of the Spectacle*. USA:Black & Red.

Deleuze, G. & Guattari, F. (1986). *Kafka: Toward a Minor Literature.* Minneapol, London: University of Minnesota Press.

Dixon, K. (2020) Demand and the reduction of consumer power in English football: A historical case-study of Newcastle United Fanzine, the mag 1988–1999. *Soccer & Society*, 21(1), pp. 96-114.

Duke, V. (1991). The sociology of football: A research agenda for the 1990s. *Sociological Review,* 29(3), pp. 627-645.

Duncombe, S. (1997). *Notes From the Underground: Zines and the Politics of Alternative Culture*. Brooklyn, New York: Verso Press.

Errickson, A. (2019). *A Detailed Journey into the Punk Subculture: Punk Outreach in Public Libraries.* (Master's Thesis, University of North Carolina. Chapel Hill, USA). Retrieved from https://cdr.lib.unc.edu/downloads/w0892f417?locale=en

Frankel, R. M. & Devers, K. J. (2000). Study Design in Qualitative Research—1: Developing Questions and Assessing Resource Needs. *Education for Health (Abingdon).* 13(2), pp. 251-261.

Giulianotti, R. (1999). *Football: A Sociology of the Global Game*. Cambridge: Polity.

Hall, S. (1980). Cultural Studies and the Centre: Some Problematics and Problems. In Hall, S. & Hobson, P. & Lowe, A. & Willis, P. (eds). *Culture, Media and Language* (pp. 2-35). London: Hutchinson.

Harte, C. (1993). The Fans Strike Back: Football Fanzines in Britain, 1972-1992. North American Society For Sport History Conference, Pennsylvania State University, USA.

Henry, T. (1989). *Break All Rules! Punk Rock and the Making of a Style*. Ann Arbor, Michigan: UMI Research Press.

Hebdige, D. (1979). *Subculture: The Meaning of Style*. London: Routledge.

Hebdige, D. (1988). *Hiding in the Light: On Images and Things*. London: Routledge.

James, K., Murdoch, M., & Guo, X. (2018). Corporate social responsibility reporting in scottish football: A marxist analysis. *Journal of Physical Fitness, Medicine & Treatment in Sports*. 2 (1), pp. 1-15.

Jary, D., Horne, J. & Bucke, T. (1991). Football "fanzines" and football culture: A case of successful "cultural contestation." *The Sociological Review*, 39 (3), pp. 581–597.

Kennedy, P. & Kennedy, D. (2016). *Football in Neo-Liberal Times: A Marxis Perspective on the European Football Industry*. London: Routledge.

Kornberger, M., Rhodes, C. & Bos, R. (2006). The others of hierarchy: Rhizomatics of organising. In Fuglsang, M. & Sorensen, B., M. (eds.) *Deleuze and the Social* (pp. 58-74). Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

Levine, H. G. & Stumpf, S. H. (1983). Statements of fear through cultural symbols: Punk rock as a reflective subculture. *Youth & Society*. 14(4), pp. 417-435.

Marx, K. (1975). *Economic and Philosophical Manuscripts of 1844*. New York:International Publishers.

Mason, J. (2002). *Qualitative Researching*. (2nd Edition). London: Sage.

Millward, P. (2008). The rebirth of the football fanzine using e-zines as data source. *Journal of Sport & Social Issues*. 32(3), pp. 299-310.

Parkes, A. (2014). This small world: The legacy and ımpact of New York City hardcore punk and straight edge in the 1980s. *The Forum: Journal of History*, 6, pp. 43-86.

Pearson, G. (1983). *Hooligan: A History of Respectable Fears*. London: Macmillan.

Peat, G. (2016). *Deconstructing the hooligan ıdentity: A critical narrative analysis of experiences ınvolving football violence*. (Master's Thesis, University of Huddersfield. Huddersfield, UK). Retrieved from http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/id/eprint/31064/1/Thesis_Final%20PEAT.pdf

Pilkington, H. (2012). Punk- but not as we know it: Punk in post-socialist space. *Punk & Post-Punk*. 3(1), pp. 253-266.

Pilz, G. A. & Wölki-Schumacher, F. (2010). Overview of the ultra culture phenomenon in the council of Europe member states in 2009. *International Conference on Ultras: Good Practices in Dealing with New Developments in Supporters' Behavi-*

our. Hannover, Leibniz University Hannover Institute of Sports Science.

Redhead, S. (1993). *The Passion and the Fashion: Football Fandom in the New Europe*. Avebury, Aldershot.

Robinson, O. C. (2014). Sampling in interview-based qualitative research: A theoretical and practical guide, *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 11(1), pp. 25-41.

Rookwood, J. & Pearson, G. (2012). The hoolifan: Positive fan attitudes to football 'hooliganism'. *International Review for the Sociology of Sport*. 47(2), pp. 149–164.

Sanders, A., Heys, B., Ravenscroft, N. & Burdsey, D. (2012). Making a difference: The power of football in the community. *Soccer & Society*, 15(3), pp. 411-429.

Serbes, H. (2021). İletişimin Avangard Mecrası: Fanzin Mitine Fenomenolojik Bir Bakış. *Etkileşim*, 7(4), pp. 236-241.

Serbes, H. & Eskicumalı, A. (2021). Kitle Toplumundan Ağ Toplumuna Taraftarlık Altkültürünün Değişim Pratikleri: Fenerbahçe Tribünü. *Akdeniz Üniversitesi İletişim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 35(17), pp. 141-157.

Serbes, H. & Güzel, M. (2020). Gençlik Altkültürleri: Punk Estetiğinin İkonografik Fanzinleri. *TRT Akademi*, 5 (10), pp. 686-713.

Shaw. P. (1989). *Whose Game is it Anyway? Book of the Football Fanzines*. Kernersville, NC: Argus Books.

Spaaij, R. (2007). Football hooliganism as a transnational phenomenon: Past and present analysis: A critique – More specificity and less generality, *The International Journal of the History of Sport*, 24(4), pp. 411-431.

Taylor, I. (1971). *Football Mad: A Speculative Sociology of Football Hooliganism*. In Dunning, E. (ed.), *The Sociology of Sport*, (pp. 352-377). London: Frank Cass.

Thortnton, S. (1995). *Club Cultures: Music, Media, and Subcultural Capital*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Van Dijk, T. A. (2015a). Critical discourse studies: A Sociocognitive approach. In Wodak, R. & Meyer, M. (Eds.), *Methods of Critical Discourse Studies* (pp. 62–85). London: Sage.

Van Dijk, T. A. (2015b). Critical discourse analysis. In Tannen, D. & Hamilton, H., E. & Schiffrin, D. (Eds) *The Handbook of Discourse Analysis*. (pp. 466-485). Hoboken, New Jersey: Blackwell.

Wodak, R. & Meyer, M. (2015). Critical discourse studies: History, agenda, theory and methodology. In R. Wodak & M. Meyer (Eds.), *Methods of Critical Discourse Studies* (pp. 1-22). London: Sage.

Worley, M. (2015). Punk, politics and british (fan)zines, 1974-84: While the world was dying, did you wonder why? *History Workshop Journal*, 79(1), pp. 76-106.

Yardley, L. (2017). Demonstrating the validity of qualitative research. *The Journal of Positive Psychology,* 12(3), pp. 295-296.